



**Questions & Answers  
O'ahu DMAP Community Presentations  
Tuesday, May 4, 2021  
Wednesday, May 5, 2021**

The questions from the Hawai'i Tourism Authority's (HTA) O'ahu Destination Management Action Plan (DMAP) Community Presentations on May 4 and May 5, 2021 have been combined and grouped by topic area. The questions are written exactly as submitted via Zoom's Question & Answer feature.

**CARRYING CAPACITY**

1. **Q: is there a number of visitors that is considered the carrying capacity for Oahu? (Chris Barzman)**
2. **Q: Does HTA have any role in addressing the challenge of the impact of Oahu's carrying capacity with respect to impact on Oahu communities. (Peter Apo)**
3. **Q: There has been talk of trying to reduce the number of tourists from 10M per year to 8M or less. Is this ever discussed by HTA? (Jeanne Herbert)**
4. **Q: Which, if any, organization controls and limits the number of flights permitted to land? (to control the number of passengers?) What is their motivation, if any, to help make Hawaii tourism sustainable? (2019 was the worst year ever, as a resident, and our visitors) (Greta Richardson)**
5. **Q: Mahalo nui Uncle Bob! Excellent mana'o - this is my Q: can please write exactly what Uncle Bob just said into the Oahu plan - finite resources, islands have limits - please :- ) (Denise Antolini)**
6. **Q: To regulate total numbers - Can't we regulated flights allowed to land at our airports? Is that Federal? (Lisa Marten)**
7. **Q: How about a moratorium on building any new hotels? (Meril Fujiki)**
8. **Q: In 2019 6.1 million choked O'ahu. What is the right number for our island? How do you manage to that? (Kathleen Pahinui)**
9. **Q: Has HTA considered a tourist carrying capacity for each island? If so what is that number for Oahu. (Donna Wong)**
10. **Q: Did you consider any concrete proposals for limiting the number of tourists thus decreasing the impacts and at the same time increasing the economic benefit to Oahu? (Meril Fujiki)**

11. Q: The draft plan has many excellent suggestions - mahalo! However, if the volume of tourists is back up to 10 million, or even 7-8-9 million, it is still overwhelming despite the positive management actions. The Draft Plan needs to set a CAP or LIMIT on volume - is the Steering Committee willing to consider it? (Denise Antolini)
12. Q: Does State of Hawaii have any input to number of flights allowed to land at Hawaii airports? If so, wouldn't controlling unfettered addition of flights and seats help reduce the increase in number of visitors? (Jeanne Herbert)
13. Q: What ideas do people have for reducing the number of visitors? (Angela Huntmer)
14. Q: What has HTA done effectively in the past to limit - not grow- the number of tourists? (Denise Antolini)
15. Q: What steps will HTA take to learn the maximum visitor capacity of Oahu? Regarding natural resources. I fear our next water shortage, sewage, hospital beds. (John Miller)
16. Q: Big philosophical-mission Q: Is HTA willing to announce - commit to - or set a cap for the number of tourists for O'ahu (e.g., 5 million) and then take adaptive action to reduce tourism once that cap is met (v. managing whatever volume comes to O'ahu)? (Denise Antolini)
17. Q: How can we limit the number of 'visitor businesses and their activities' in our residential communities? (example, Hawaii Kai, countless boat and water activity companies and their boats have almost tripled in the last 5 years, taking up parking spaces in shopping centers, as well as creating over crowded areas in our oceans and marina. So many fewer whales in the last 5 years here) (Greta Richardson)
18. Q: Can HTA not seek to return to pre pandemic tourism volumes? Or is that absolutely at odds with its DNA? (ivan kaisan)
19. Q: Is there any recognition that there may be an upper limit to the number of tourists that are sustainable for our Islands? (Wendy Kuntz)
20. Q: has anyone reviewed what Europe does to control tourism? I believe there are several countries that have limits. (m burke)
21. Q: Why have the number of tourists grown so much past target goals? (Why has sustainability not been implemented?) (Elizabeth Kieszowski)
22. Q: What is the appropriate 2022 monthly and annual visitor arrival count for O'ahu? (Mahina Paishon-Duarte)
23. Q: was the visitor limit at Hanuama bay set too high considering the recovery made by nature during the COVID shutdown? (John Miller)

A: The HTA does not measure its success by the number of visitors to Hawai'i. States do not have the ability to unfairly restrict or limit interstate travel by citizens. Freedom of movement within and between U.S. states is constitutionally protected which means that the State of Hawai'i cannot limit

people from traveling to Hawai'i. While some countries set limits on the number of visitors, we in the U.S. cannot do that legally. However, the airlines adjust their flight schedules depending on demand. It should be noted that the plethora of flights and air seats benefit residents who want to travel for vacation or visit family abroad, as well as those who need to travel for medical reasons or for work.

Local ordinances and zoning serve as tools that may make it possible to restrict new development and address the growing impact of illegal short-term vacation rentals. While it may not be legal to put a cap (limit) on the number of people who visit our state, limiting the lodging supply may be just as effective. Enforcement on illegal vacation rentals is also key to managing visitor numbers. There hasn't been a significant number of hotel rooms or legal vacation rentals added in the past few years, so the spike in visitor numbers was in large part due to the rise in illegal short-term rentals.

The state and city may also consider limiting the number of camping permits for visitors as well. Also, a very important strategy is ensuring that places do not get overcrowded, especially those deemed as hotspots. That's part of managing tourism, and that's part of what we are trying to identify through the DMAP process.

## **REGENERATIVE TOURISM**

- 1. Q: Mahalo nui for taking my question, Kalani. Great news! As a follow up: How does HTA plan to synergize/coordinate with stakeholders who are already working on regenerative tourism? (Mondenna Jamshidi Kent)**
- 2. Q: What is the definition of "regenerative tourism" exactly? (Meril Fujiki)**
- 3. Q: How can we "regenerate resources" by having more people utilizing those limited resources? (Piliialoha Callahan)**
- 4. Q: Please explain the actions that HTA is taking, or planning to take, in order to "control growth" and encourage "responsible tourism." (Maxx Phillips)**
- 5. Q: About caring, Oahu tourism has been on the back of service industry workers esp in the most overused destination (Waikiki). Did the steering committee consider their critical and unique role in regenerative tourism strategies? (Carolyn Weygan-Hildebrand)**
- 6. Q: 'just to clarify that I am not asking about same old tourism but honest-to-goodness regenerative tourism. (Carolyn Weygan-Hildebrand)**
- 7. Q: Can some of us participating on this presentation volunteer to be part of the Regenerative Tourism Advisory Committee? (Karen, Wedding Estates Hawaii LLC)**
- 8. Q: Does Regenerative tourism equal traveler community service? (John Miller)**
- 9. Q: Great conversation. I would encourage regenerative tourism to also include our island youth. Many urban students on Oahu have never had any of these aloha aina opportunities. Collaborative learning between local students and visitors, especially visiting youth, is ver**

powerful. How do we include and expand opportunities for local students to experience cultural and natural resources? (Wendy Kuntz)

10. Q: Regenerative tourism : what specific community benefits agreements (CBA) can be done for the Honolulu, Leeward, Windward North Shore Communities by the Tourism Business? That would help to define this nice term. (Luciano Minerbi)
11. Q: Can you define what Regenerative Tourism means and how this can be applied in Hawaii? (Pauline Worsham)
12. Q: Aloha! I was wondering if we have any feedback from visitors that have experienced sustainable activities and/or experiences in the last couple of months on Oahu and if we are delivering up to expectations? (Alejandro Moxey)
13. Q: It's one thing to ask residents how they feel about things like "regenerative tourism fees," but have we also asked visitors how they would feel about such fees? (Paul Lawler)
14. Q: I put a question earlier and no one responded on if some of us can volunteer to be part of the Regenerative Tourism Advisory Committee? (Karen, Wedding Estates Hawai'i LLC)
15. Q: We assume tourists want to be responsible. Most tourists want to get out from their daily routine. Go to the beach. The majority of visitors don't care if they go to Hawaii, Seychelles or Jamaica. It's not about culture for most visitors. They don't want to be educated and unfortunately they want sun, beach and party or relax their way. The program is great for the minority of tourists interested in appreciating culture and community. We cannot easily select tourists without destroying the business generated by the majority of travelers. How would this concept you introduced fit into this reality? (Juergen Steinmetz)
16. Q: Will the state commit to adding all of the community service opportunities for tourist to do to the websites? (John Miller)
17. Q: What Destinations, other than Hawaii are managing tourism well ? Have the balance between sustainability and economic success? (Margie Lehman)
18. Q: What if we encourage or require large events to implement a cultural x environmental sustainability component into their programs which require participation from visitors/attendees? Can we also implement cultural and volunteer programs to military as well who are stationed here? Perhaps we could reference or use the local2030 dashboard to possibly track metrics? (Francine Beppu)

A: Regenerative tourism takes sustainability one step further and focuses on the net benefit of the visitor economy to a destination, looking at the social and cultural benefits. It regenerates natural and cultural resources, centers community voices at the heart of tourism development, ensures tourism enriches the quality of life for residents, and drives responsible economic growth.

This may not come solely as a result of implementing fee structures, but through volunteer opportunities for visitors to give back during their trip. HTA spoke about its Mālama Hawai'i program as a way for visitors to give back, and as part of a regenerative tourism effort. The program was

created in coordination with the Hawai'i Visitors and Convention Bureau and various visitor industry partners and community organizations. You can find out more about Mālama Hawai'i and the volunteer opportunities here: [www.gohawaii.com/malama](http://www.gohawaii.com/malama).

Establishing a "Regenerative Tourism Advisory Committee" for the City and County of Honolulu to identify and manage problem issues for O'ahu is currently a proposed anchor action for this DMAP, so it's still a work in progress. We understand that some visitors may not want to volunteer or do work while on vacation in Hawai'i, but our marketing efforts will be focused on educating the avid, mindful, and respectful traveler, who is interested in the Mālama Hawai'i program, as well as learning about Hawai'i, its culture and people. We are also working with our travel partners to educate visitors before they arrive, and are messaging to visitors while they are on island to travel respectfully through our kuleana videos.

### **VACATION RENTALS**

- 1. Q: What are the plans to utilize privately owned vacation rentals as part of a more integrative and emersive tourist option compared to more hotesl especially on the north shore (Martin Hubert)**
- 2. Q: WHAT IS CONSIDERED SHORT TERM VACATION RENTAL? LESS THAN ONE MONTH STAY? (Greg Brossier)**
- 3. Q: One of the solutions to better manage visitors on O'ahu involves discouraging short-term vacation rentals. Assuming vacation rentals are operating lawfully within the restricted zones, why would this be a solution? It seems to be something that would help hotels but not necessarily solve the visitor numbers. (Patti Jette)**
- 4. Q: Does DPP have sufficient staff and funding to enforce laws against illegal vacation rentals? If not how will they ever be eliminated? (Donna Wong)**
- 5. Q: Is it HTA's position that Untill unregulated accomodations are controlled - no new permits can be issued? (John Miller)**
- 6. Q: What about creating incentives for people to register and declare their rentals. If not, they then will have to pay penalties and potential greater penalties for not registering. (Kimo Kippen)**
- 7. Q: With illegal short term rentals so prevalent as Mr Egged shared, what are the penalties for these "absentee" owners who rent out their homes illegally? Stiffer penalties to include violation of Federal Interstate Commerce laws which makes these types of violation of law a federal offense. (Phillip Soon)**
- 8. Q: It's understandable to go after those illegal renters who don't live on Oahu, but what is so bad about Auntie down the street or local people renting out a short-term renatal in her house? Those \$\$ stay here on Oahu and grow our economy. (Cynthia Thurlow)**

9. **Q: Can HTA funding support additional enforcement of illegal rentals because department of planning and permitting seems overwhelmed. Such as no enforcement in evenings or weekends. (Wendy Kuntz)**
10. **Q: Why isn't the city reducing the vacation rentals in homes and apartments? We need those back in the housing market for our locals. (Carol Lopez)**
11. **Q: Are you considering including stake holders including organizations like OSTR and HILSTRA in working through workable solutions? (John An)**
12. **Q: How do you plan on discouraging the illegal vacation rentals? DPP has not done the admin rules yet. So do you wait? No one is pushing Airbnb to provide the addresses for the vacation rentals. We have a list on the city website. So what do we do now? Or how long must we wait? (Kathleen Pahinui)**
13. **Q: The short term B&B (vacation rentals are taking away local housing opportunity and needs to end. The visitors are not filling the hotels due to the vacation rentals. (Carol Lopez)**
14. **Q: How much greater would this revenue be if all the visitors who stay at illegal vacation rentals, camping grounds, and other forms of rentals that avoid the tax were given a specific conservation tax that is required of visitors before entering our islands? (Oriana McCallum)**
15. **Q: Is it worth considering that too much focus on the Short Term Rentals directly vs understanding that Hawaii has done a poor job at growing with the tourism industry as many people don't travel in couples anymore but instead as groups, large families and accommodations don't support those groups in both accommodation and reasonable rates. If accommodation options were more "accommodating" visitors wouldn't lean so much to rentals vs booking multiple rooms for extended period of time at high rates (Racquel Achiu)**
16. **Q: what leverage or tools does HTA have to reduce vacation rentals in residential neighborhoods? (Lisa Marten)**

A: Each county has its own rules and definition of "short-term/vacation rental." On O'ahu, the City and County of Honolulu defines short-term rentals (STRs) as lodgings that provide guest accommodation for less than 30 days: [www.honolulu.gov/dppstr/default.html](http://www.honolulu.gov/dppstr/default.html). Limiting the number of accommodations is part of tourism management. As John De Fries mentioned during the meeting, legal accommodations in Hawai'i can accommodate about seven million visitors annually, which many would say is a manageable number of visitors, and the remainder of the 10.4 million visitors who came to Hawai'i in 2019 were quite possibly staying in illegal vacation rentals. Honolulu Mayor Blangiardi told HTA and those in the visitor industry during a meeting a couple months ago that his administration is making it a priority to crack down on illegal vacation rentals. There are a few short-term rentals in residential areas if they received permits years ago, but for the most part, visitor accommodations do not belong in our residential areas – they belong in designated resort districts such as Waikiki, Ko Olina, and Turtle Bay. Many people who stay in short-term rentals also rent a car because there are usually no parking fees to disincentivize the guests from renting a car, and there are no shuttles like hotels have to get them around. Someone who is renting an illegal vacation rental near Laniākea Beach, for example, would have to pass by that beach daily to get to and from their rental, which adds to the traffic. We understand that many people travel in large groups, and

hotels often have rooms that can accommodate families or have adjoining rooms. Sure, it sometimes costs more to stay in a hotel than a vacation rental, however we are not aiming to attract visitors who want cheap accommodations. We also want to ensure that businesses are paying their fair share in taxes, and many illegal vacation rentals are not contributing to the Transient Accommodations Tax (TAT).

## **VISITOR EDUCATION**

- 1. Q: How do you propose to better educate visitors when planning and en route to visit here. (For example, safety , respect etc) (Racquel Achiu)**
- 2. Q: Who will review the safety for visitors? You tube instructs lots of guests. Lots of education is needed for ocean safety. (Bob Leinau)**
- 3. Q: While we hope to be at a place without worry of COVID, it still exists. What steps are being or will be taken to ensure that visitors are aware of the requirements for mask wearing (or other requirements)? (If we are talking about encouraging responsible behavior, how can we help them to understand the importance to our communities?) (Lynn Otaguro)**
- 4. Q: Yes Denise Antolini and others. I can offer Ocen Safety 'Ohana, OceanSafetyOhana.org as a convening entity for this intention to educate visitors as well as locals on safe and respectful access mauka to makai. (Jessamy Hornor)**
- 5. Q: Have you heard about this program? Would it be possible to include similar interdisciplinary programs (which would also help to economically support and engage the local creative industry) into the educational material that tourists receive before and after they visit? (Jeanine Markley)**
- 6. Q: We need to present a new narrative to potential visitors. Far too many come with an attitude that Hawaii is a party destination and they come and trash our home and leave. ARE there any ideas for a new narrative in marketing Oahu as a visitor destination to prevent disrespectful tourist behavior? (Steven Thomas)**
- 7. Q: Can HTA ask all airlines to commit to \*mandatory\* "e komo mai" video (not an optional one buried in the video library)? and make the visitors sign a pledge to be respectful like Palau (<https://palaupledge.com/>) (Denise Antolini)**
- 8. Q: Yes, along the lines of taking off our slippers, can we teach visitors to ask permission before entering a place, to be respectful and for their safety and wellbeing? (Jessamy Hornor)**
- 9. Q: Why would a visitor be receptive to "you're a visitor in our home" when we don't take good care of our "house" ourselves? (Keoni Lee)**
- 10. Q: I mean asking permission from the place they enter, in line with Hawaiian cultural protocol. (Jessamy Hornor)**

11. **Q: Similar to the video you are required to watch before going to Hanauma bay. Can we require airlines to show a video to let tourists know how to respect and act in our home? (Keoni Willing)**
12. **Q: Wasn't there previously a video that played on every airplane that landed at HNL? that didn't educate anyone. (John Miller)**
13. **Q: Can we implement a video that visitors watch on the plane before they arrive here to help make them "responsible visitors"? (Mike Leanio)**
14. **Q: Is an inflight education video and pledge to protect part of the plan yet? (Angela Huntemer)**

A: Travelers are being educated through a series of videos that HTA and HVCB created and distributed to the airlines, hotels, and other visitor industry partners:

[www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/media/3623/19-20-hta\\_hvcb-kuleana-campaign.pdf](http://www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/media/3623/19-20-hta_hvcb-kuleana-campaign.pdf)

[www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/media/5484/campaign-to-educate-visitors.pdf](http://www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/media/5484/campaign-to-educate-visitors.pdf)

Currently we are unable to mandate a company to show the videos and the various airlines each charge thousands of dollars a month to place an ad on the flights. We are grateful that many of the airlines are showing the educational videos pro bono, especially regarding Hawai'i's mask mandate. In addition, there is an increase of airline passengers watching or using their own devices on the aircraft rather than the airlines'. Education is important, but enforcement is crucial as well when someone breaks the law, order or mandate. Ocean safety is one of the many topics the videos cover. HTA has also paid for the ocean safety advertising campaign at Hawai'i's airports. Lifeguards also play a key role, and HTA has funded lifeguard safety programs in all counties as well as the statewide junior lifeguard program. In addition, much of HTA's brand marketing budget is focused on visitor education, more than ever before.

#### **VISITOR FEES/TAXES**

1. **Q: How does the HTA look at the topic of Green fee or tax? (Leanna Mix)**
2. **Q: What reasons are given in opposition to a bill that provides a visitors tax to tourists and promotes all of these agendas not pass the house? (Oriana McCallum)**
3. **Q: What about a Green fee levied on tourists? People have been willing to pay \$150 for pre travel Covid tests. Why not a \$20 fee to protect and restore natural resources being stressed by large numbers of visitors? (Jeanne Herbert)**
4. **Q: What about using Safe Travels Hawaii website, or something similar to collect green fees to each traveler arriving in Hawaii? (Jeanne Herbert)**
5. **Q: Is a 100\$ green fee part of the plan yet? (Angela Huntemer)**
6. **Q: Has a visitor conservation and tourism tax ever been considered to that would not only provide funding specifically for HTA's pillars, but would allow for the tourists themselves to intentionally be contributing in a positive way to Hawai'i's preservation? (Oriana McCallum)**



7. **Q: Other destinations collect a fee per visitor when they book their trips. You could track it there as when you track incoming visitors. No? Funds should be used to support Ocean Safety EMS HFD HPD Road Maintenance, Parks etc. (Racquel Achiu)**
8. **Q: Ok why are we 20 years behind the rest of the world implementing user fees for high-impact recreational areas? It is widely demonstrated that reasonable user fees do not scare visitors away. (Dolan Eversole)**
9. **Q: An example of a country that controls tourism to support financial the environment and protect their culture is Bhutan. While it may be extreme, perhaps there are lessons that can be learned. Certainly requiring a premium to support these issues would help. Have other places been reviewed for inspiration? (Joanne Amberg)**
10. **Q: One of the most obvious ways to manage tourism is to raise prices on places that are public areas—beaches, parks, that use public resources. (Hanauma Bay—why not raise it to \$25 per person for tourists, it is a premium destination?). What’s the hesitation? Why not do this? When you cheapen a destination more people come. If you want to slow tourism, then raise prices. Why isn’t this being done? (Stephanie Han)**
11. **Q: Attracting higher paying visitors has been talked about for a long time and we have failed to do so. I’m curious if there has been any studies on the price sensitivity of tourists re TAT? Seems like we raised it and more tourists showed up in following years. Why not raise it even more to generate additional tax revenue? Accomplishes the same thing as attracting the higher paying visitor but would be immediately actionable. This would also help to provide funds for all of these great ideas. (Keoni Lee)**
12. **Q: A general response to several questions regarding creating or increasing user fees. It has been widely demonstrated globally and locally (including Hanauma Bay) that reasonable increases to user fees does little to slow the use of an area but instead benefits the sustainable use and management of the area and in turn make it even more desirable. Hawaii is way behind the times on implementing user fees, especially for visitors. (Dolan Eversole)**
13. **Q: at this point tourism was almost lost. Hawaii has competition once borders reopen. Policymaking visitors is not a solution. Yes a ranger is good, but lets not scare visitors away before they are even coming back. (Juergen Steinmetz)**

A: We feel that visitors can and should contribute to helping to preserve our natural resources, especially those who visit our parks, hiking trails, beaches, etc. while in Hawai'i. Those decisions are up to the governor, mayors, legislators and council members. The state and counties can raise entrance and parking fees for visitors at parks to help pay for safety, upkeep, and reinvestment in those parks. However, by law we are not allowed to charge people an "entrance" fee into our state. Freedom of movement within and between the U.S. states is constitutionally protected, so charging someone an entrance fee may prohibit him/her from entering if he/she cannot afford to pay the fee. However, we will add your suggestion for an environmental fee and if it is supported by many others we will see how it could be implemented in another way. Raising fees is one way of managing tourism. The City and County of Honolulu Parks and Recreation Department is in charge of setting the fee for Hanauma Bay. Another way of managing tourism is by limiting the number of park-goers.

The Parks department recently implemented a reservation system at Hanauma Bay to control the number of guests.

### **VISITOR INDUSTRY – LABOR**

- 1. Q: I am a bit stunned by all the discussion about ‘regenerative tourism’ and the importance of aloha when workers in the hospitality industry are being treated so poorly by large corporate hotel owners. Where do fair labor practices fit into this vision? (Amy Perruso)**

A: Thank you for bringing up the issue of fair labor practices. We made note of it and will add this to the list of items for the Steering Committee to review.

### **VISITOR INDUSTRY – TOUR OPERATORS**

- 1. Q: How can we enforce responsibility for being respectful to our environment , sealife and neighborhoods from not only visitors, but tour operators as well? (Nicole Nestel)**
- 2. Q: How can we reduce the numbers of commercial tours over-crowding North Shore beaches like Sharks Cove, Pu'aena, Ali'i, Three Tables, etc. ? (Nicole Nestel)**
- 3. Q: One issue which should be addressed is the management of tourism services vendors to ensure that they deliver their experiences with minimal impact on citizens. There should be a Vendor Management entity in HTA to work with vendors to minimize impacts and to accept complaints and work with vendors to resolve. The approach can be collaborative rather than having to have legal authority. Examples which come to mind are tour busses with loud speakers (where in Europe they have headphones), Segways running people over on sidewalks in Waikiki, Surf Schools using Kuhio beach and park and parking all day in 2 hour limit areas. There are plenty more. Bob M. mentioned a "Pono" certification for vendors. This entity could be used to designate vendors who are deserving. (John Lacy)**
- 4. Q: Some of this behavior is promulgated by tour operators, like swimming with dolphins, parking in neighborhoods, touching turtles, we need to not only suggest, but also enforce (Nicole Nestel)**
- 5. Q: Many Beach Vendors take up valuable parking and beach space to run their business's. Why is this not policed as beaches are public. When i go to the Haleiwa Beach you can see over 6 surf or paddle board rentals vendors, along with offering lessons. (Valeriano Garrido)**
- 6. Q: Local push back is at a point now where they do not want to let transportation companies stop at local parks. We need to have places for older folks that need to use restrooms ... regularly. (Bob Leinau)**

A: HTA can work with the tour operators to better educate them about best practices in sustainable tourism and caring for our ocean and wildlife, if needed. Over the past couple of years, HTA has provided funding to the Sustainable Tourism Association of Hawai'i (formerly known as the Hawai'i Ecotourism Association) to support their Sustainable Tour Operator Certification program:

<https://www.sustainabletourismhawaii.org/certification/>.

## VISITOR INDUSTRY – HOTEL OPERATORS/AIRLINES/ONLINE TRAVEL AGENTS (OTAs)

1. **Q: how can we close the gap between the publicly traded companies (i.e. OTAs, Hotels, Airlines) that have a fiduciary responsibility to maximizing revenues via high occupancy/loads and the vision Hawaii has to keep visitor counts down and/or bring in a specific type of visitor? (Chris Barzman)**
2. **Q: How active and interested are the Waikiki hotel owners in helping in the HTA mission mentioned at the beginning of today's session? (Jeanine Markley)**
3. **Q: How is HTA going to work with the industry to make sure they adjust to a new reality? (Pauline Sheldon)**
4. **Q: Is John R saying that new hotels are the problem? (John Miller)**

A: HTA will communicate and share with our visitor industry and businesses about the O'ahu DMAP final actions and how they can help move the actions forward. Successful implementation of the O'ahu DMAP will depend on public and private sectors coming together to move the actions forward.

## NATURAL RESOURCES

1. **Q: Besides the 'hotspots' what type of attention will be given to improve the facilities of all the community beaches that are accessed and deteriorated by tourism? (Oriana McCallum)**
2. **Q: Touching on "balance between tourism and Hawaii" Is there an action plan on conserving our current resources?? (Piliialoha Callahan)**
3. **Q: Pls look at the commercialization of our parks and beaches and what we can do to move away from that use. (Kathleen Pahinui)**
4. **Q: Thank you it is was meant as a question.....how are the controls at Hanuma Bay working? What are the results? (Kimo Kippen)**
5. **Q: Why isnt the strain on our natural resources "Water" never mentioned as a part of tourism picture? the public beach showers usage if water is very high without water conservation devices on them, same goes for hotel rooms. yet the community is always warned to conserve water. (Valeriano Garrido)**
6. **Q: Can we please include residents, as a natural resource to Hawaii? So many wonderful residents have moved from Hawaii in the last 5 years, due to quality of life here has dropped so much, which costs our community in countless ways. (income, as they are high income earners, they were family, friends, and now many of us have to decide, do we stay here without many of our family & friends, or do we too, move to join them) (Greta Richardson)**
7. **Q: so doesn't preservation of natural resources mean allocations on tourism? i believe european countries have limits on how many / when (m burke)**

**8. Q: What is the action plan on conserving our current resources and being able to sustain that while inviting people from around the world to visit our home? (Piliialoha Callahan)**

**9. Q: Have you explored what the National Park Service system? (Kimo Kippen)**

A: One of HTA's strategic pillars is natural resources, and HTA has funded and supported dozens of non-profits that are working to protect Hawai'i's natural resources. HTA is not in charge of our natural resources – for the state it's the Department of Land & Natural Resources (DLNR) that holds that responsibility and for the city it's the Parks department. However, HTA continues to be actively engaged with both departments to support them in their efforts. It's not only visitors who use our natural resources – many residents enjoy them as well. We also had members of the National Park Service on our Maui Nui and Hawai'i Island Steering Committees, representing Haleakalā and Hawai'i Volcanoes National Parks, who provided valuable insight.

## **CULTURE**

**1. Q: The local and cultural sites have been over run by visitors and there is no control. The State needs to reduce the visitor totals coming in daily to avoid the ocean from getting polluted and the trails from being runned by too many people at one time. The locals are being pushed out in many cases and this needs to stop. (Carol Lopez)**

**2. Q: Having that Hawai'i is the planet's healing center, Are there resources within the regenerative plan to offer training / experiences based on Hawaiian spiritual practice within the tourism workplace and visitor sector? (Elijah McShane)**

**3. Q: I was asked to retype my question perhaps in shorter form: Are safety agencies being invited to the table? Do we have resources to dedicate to both locals and visitor safety? Regarding cultural respect and safety both, can we educate visitors to ask permission and to kilo / observe conditions before entering a place, mauka or makai, in line with Hawaiian cultural protocol? Can we improve signage on site and digitally as well? (Jessamy Hornor)**

**4. Q: How were Hawaiian organizations consulted, such as the Association of Hawaiian Civic Clubs, SCHHA, Royal Societies? (Marilyn Khan)**

**5. Q: How much "nohona ho'omanawanui" do Native Hawaiians and the local population have to endure before it leads to more hostility toward visitors if tourist behavior and attitudes toward those living here are not changed? (Don Aweau)**

**6. Q: When you say Hawaiian culture, this cannot continue to be the same old appropriated commercialized version that has been the norm over the years. What will change? (Steven Thomas)**

**7. Q: When you say Hawaiian culture, this cannot continue to be the same old appropriated commercialized version that has been the norm over the years. What will change in the way we present Hawaiian culture to visitors? (Steven Thomas)**

8. **Q: what is being done to sustain hawaiian culture - meaning HAWAIIAN PEOPLE! poorly educated, economically challenged, not home owners - how can tourism directly support HAWAIIANS and local residents (over 30 yrs) (m burke)**
9. **Q: What kumu or other cultural resources were invited to this discussion? (ThoraJean Cuaresma)**

A: One of HTA's strategic pillars is Hawaiian culture, and HTA over the years has invested millions of dollars to support non-profits that have worked to perpetuate our Hawaiian culture through our Kūkulu Ola program. HTA also funds the Native Hawaiian Hospitality Association (NaHHA), which works to shape the future of Hawai'i's visitor industry by utilizing Hawaiian cultural values as the foundation for professional development and business leadership. NaHHA offers consultation, training and networking opportunities to those who provide authentic experiences to Hawai'i's visitors. To learn more about NaHHA, visit: [www.nahha.com](http://www.nahha.com). HTA also has a dedicated Director of Hawaiian Cultural Affairs and Natural Resources, as well as a number of Native Hawaiian staff members, who are continuously working to ensure that the Hawaiian culture is preserved and presented in an authentic manner, and woven into our visitor industry.

## **ECONOMY**

1. **Q: Environment and Economy St corner for whom specifically? — class analysis is needed of distribution and costs and benefits including how much tourism \$ will go out of the island and which \$ amount remains in the islands and which amount of tourism \$ will never come into Hawaii? Mahalo (Luciano Minerbi)**
2. **Q: what strategies are being considered to reduce economic leakage? (Chris Barzman)**
3. **Q: Is there concern that the eagerness to regenerate the economy is displacing the safety of the people of Hawaii. (Racquel Achiu)**
4. **Q: Has the committee considered what industry or economic driver would replace the lost revenue from less tourism and what could be done to seed, support or attract those economic replacements? (Rick Schneider)**
5. **Q: What percentage of the revenue raised by tourism has annually been spent on tourists and how much on services for residents (Meril Fujiki)**
6. **Q: Why not diversify more into film and TV? Good economic driver, less impact, good jobs. (Kathleen Pahinui)**
7. **Q: Many kama`aina family have not visited Waikiki in years. We have for far too long put all our eggs in the tourism basket to support our economy. Why are we not spending more money, energy and resources to make our community less reliant on the tourist dollar? (ThoraJean Cuaresma)**
8. **Q: The Pandemic has been a wake up call... It has made us realize how dependent the State is on tourism business . This needs to change. Hawaii needs to get back to diversity and farming, dairies, other businesses that don;t rely on tourism. (Carol Lopez)**

A: The mission of HTA's 2025 Strategic Plan is "to strategically manage Hawai'i tourism in a sustainable manner consistent with economic goals, cultural values, preservation of natural resources, community desires and visitor industry needs." The purpose of the Destination Management Action Plan is to reset, rebuild and redefine O'ahu's visitor industry through community-desired actions. HTA's role is not overall economic development/diversification for the entire state. However, through our work, tourism can help to diversify the economy by supporting other industries, like agriculture or film and tv production. One of the draft proposed actions is supporting local businesses.

### **MOVING FORWARD**

1. **Q: Looking at the map of folks on this call, it is missing meaningful representation from the communities being inundated by "off the beaten path" tourism. How are you going to ensure that these communities are allowed to meaningfully contribute to the ideas/solutions for these action areas? (Keoni Lee)**
2. **Q: I like a lot of the goals I'm seeing! And I like that some of them involve follow-up organizations. But that does bring up the question of Next Steps in planning -- who's responsible for each thing in the plan, resources needed, etc.? (John Knox)**
3. **Q: So much of what is being said has been done - just review old presentations at HTA / HVCB industry events. What will change and be different? (Kathleen Pahinui)**
4. **Q: HTA and HVCB tried for the higher spending visitor and we ended up with lots of visitors who weren't spending in 2019. What will be different this time? (Kathleen Pahinui)**
5. **Q: how can we help this transition? how will the public be informed? (Damian Mcpherson)**
6. **Q: I have worked with HVCB and other visitor bureaus on this island and other islands and they always tried for marketing that showed fun with respect for Hawaii and the culture and natural resources. And all it did was bring more people and they are still harassing the honu at Laniakea. What will be different this time? (Kathleen Pahinui)**
7. **Q: Mr. DeFries stated the objectives very succinctly. Once the DMAP is finalized and in place, how will it be executed and managed? Will there be added laws, statutes put in place to mandate certain business practices to ensure we don't get back to the 10.4M visitors? Or how will we do a better job of ensuring the visitors who do come have a greater respect for our culture, aina and resources? The current PR effort is good, but will that really work? Mahalo. (Jon Conching)**
8. **Q: How is this new direction different than the old direction? (Jade DeCosta)**

A: The members of the Steering Committee who created the draft proposed actions also represent their communities and various sectors on O'ahu. These community presentations were the next step in obtaining community input. There is also the opportunity to provide feedback via an online input form. All input is being reviewed and once the actions are in its near-final stages, HTA will work with the City and O'ahu Visitors Bureau to determine the appropriate lead and support agencies and

organizations. The draft proposed actions are not finalized and will take a few more iterations. Once the O'ahu DMAP is finalized, it will be released to the public and HTA will communicate to the public about how they can help move actions forward. What is new and different so far is the process underway in developing the O'ahu DMAP – with a diverse Steering Committee, community presentations, and an online input form – these are all new activities allowing for community-led solutions.

### **BENEFITS FOR RESIDENTS**

1. **Q: I don't see anything for locals. Is a reservation system going to honor us by giving us priority? How about a kamaaina day or time? (Jeannine Johnson)**
2. **Q: All of these items have been discussed before, yet the current tourists are unsustainable and are growing out of control with crazy taxes and prices. In the end the kama'aina are suffering. What is REALLY being done rather than just talking to locals about it? (Terrance Lum)**
3. **Q: Appreciate the work of the Oahu DMAP Steering Committee and especially managing access at Natural Resource areas. One of the problems for locals is access to these areas since emphasis is placed on tourists. Would the plan consider an objective that balances access to such areas between tourists and locals, for example, setting aside days for use by tourists vs residents, reduced access rates for residents, etc.? (Marilyn Khan)**
4. **Q: What if communities do not believe there is a mutual benefit to tourism? Were options considered for not having tourists come to certain areas (or islands) for pre-determined days of the week, months, seasons? (Jessie Faige)**
5. **Q: Although the HTA's efforts are appreciated and we know that tourism is a valuable commodity, have we not learned with this pandemic that we need to make places like Waikiki more kamaaina friendly? (ThoraJean Cuaresma)**
6. **Q: When I hear about this discussion, it was mentioned an idea to consider preventing tour businesses from operating in residential areas on weekends, is that still be considered? Would be excellent, since we as residents are normally off on the weekends, and cant enjoy our own neighborhoods any more, do to the number of visitors. (Greta Richardson)**
7. **Q: Many kama`aina family have not visited Waikiki in years. We have for far too long put all our eggs in the tourism basket to support our economy. Why are we not spending more money, energy and resources to make our community less reliant on the tourist dollar? (ThoraJean Cuaresma)**

A: We suggest you refer to the Hā'ena State Park reservation system on Kaua'i, which HTA played a significant role in helping to roll out: <https://www.gohaena.com>. Hawai'i residents are exempt from the fee and reservation requirement, and kama'aina have rarely been turned away from entering this park. The DLNR is using this system as a model for other future reservations systems. That's what this DMAP process is all about – an action plan for HTA, the counties, and others such as DLNR and the City's Parks department.

Tourism provides jobs and taxes to run our government. In 2019, before the pandemic, tourism in Hawai'i generated \$17.75 billion in spending, \$2.07 billion in taxes for our state, and supported 216,000 jobs. Resident sentiment is one of the key performance indicators for HTA, and keep in mind that all of our staff are also Hawai'i residents. We are working with the City to help them crack down on illegal vacation rentals because they do not belong in our residential communities. Back when most visitors stayed in Waikiki, residents didn't have as much of an issue with them since they weren't staying in our neighborhoods.

## **LEGISLATIVE**

1. **Q: I do not like to bash anyone but/and .... Planning comes first and not just project by project planning .. holistic planning (government funded). Then comes the time line and CIP competition. (more political kuleana), Then real plans permits contracts, etc (often with government entities) .... Where I am going with this line of logic is that the politicians need to get a good portion of the blame for our current situation. It certainly is not the tourists fault that we have inadequate infrastructure. We market for them to come [in a very competitive global market place] ... they spend billions of dollars here and some people have decided that the tourists are the bad guys. I'm having a hard time with that line of logic. To me the best part of our Hawaii experience is great weather with an abundance of Natural assets [which need more development and funding for R&M and enforcement] ... not hotel lobbies.**
2. **How do we get politicians to generat a win-win that works for everyone? (Bob Leinau)**
3. **Q: How can we get this information to the Governor to urge him to veto the defunding of HTA that passed our legislature? (Mary Ann Lentz)**
4. **Q: How much support does the HTA expect, going into the next few years, from the State of Hawaii? With budget adjustments and the possible creation of a new and seperate tourism "authority" under the legislature, will the HTA future plans be sustainable? (Phillip Soon)**
5. **Q: The legislature proposed to remove one or more of the pillars on which this plan is based, for example, the Hawaiian culture. How will this impact upon the proposed plans for all islands? What are HTA's future plans to address this threat to its mission? Also, will the plans include community benefits, meaning how will the community benefit by tourism? (Marilyn Khan)**
6. **Q: Is kokua needed to talk story to our Governor to veto the recent Senate Bill that reduced substantive marketing funding to HTA? (Manuel Kuloloia)**
7. **Q: Just FYI.. the Senate passed SR 218 at the last session.. URGING THE HAWAII TOURISM AUTHORITY TO EXPLORE AND IMPLEMENT A VISITOR PLEDGE OF ALOHA TO EDUCATE AND EXPLAIN THE IMPORTANCE OF HAWAII'S ENVIRONMENT AND CULTURE AND ENCOURAGE INCREASED RESPECT AND APPRECIATION OF THE HAWAIIAN ISLANDS.**  
**[https://www.capitol.hawaii.gov/measure\\_indiv.aspx?billtype=SR&billnumber=218&year=2021](https://www.capitol.hawaii.gov/measure_indiv.aspx?billtype=SR&billnumber=218&year=2021) (Bennette Misalucha)**



A: That's the balance we are looking for as well – providing benefits for both residents and visitors. Resident satisfaction and visitor satisfaction are both key performance measures for HTA. That's why HTA's interacting pillars are Hawaiian culture, natural resources, community, and brand marketing. You can read more about our Strategic Plan here:

[www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/media/4286/hta-strategic-plan-2020-2025.pdf](http://www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/media/4286/hta-strategic-plan-2020-2025.pdf). The Legislature put back funding for HTA's Hawaiian culture pillar in its final version of HB862. That bill is now on the governor's desk for consideration. If you'd like to reach out to the governor to share a message of support for HTA, you can do it here: <https://governor.hawaii.gov/contact-us/comments-on-legislation/?fbclid=IwAR3juTLPA0FR7krnfECpQKpP1fZe3ZlUV0ipPuaKBW4vpxr44cYMpkCW8Cl>.

## **PROPOSED ACTIONS**

1. **Q: Arn't all of these proposed anchor actions already in place. I want to know how that are going to be different? (John Miller)**
2. **Q: I am reading the action plan but I don't see any implementation - only things like reduce visitor impacts by improving infrastructure.... how? We have been talking about reducing impacts for a very long time but with no real solutions. What about tolls, green fees, infrastructure fees? I see a reservation system - and the first bullet is explore it why explore? It is working at Hanauma Bay. Just implement it. Sorry too many years of too much talking and no action. (Kathleen Pahinui)**
3. **Q: Who should bear the costs of these shifts? Has your group addressed that issue? (Amy Perruso)**
4. **Q: I'm a Wahiawa NB member and I'm wondering why HTA representatives have never worked with the NBs to receive input as well as report out on plans that would affect our island communities? (Don Aweau)**
5. **Q: Where any members of the Honolulu neighborhood boards consulted? Not seeing any. (Jacob Wiencek)**
6. **Q: If you work with organizations on other islands are there still opportunities for input? (Mondenna Jamshidi Kent)**

A: The proposed draft actions are not in place. They may have come up as ideas. Many of the issues have been going on for years. To get a sense of what the other counties have come up with, please refer to the Kaua'i, Maui Nui, and Hawai'i Island DMAPs: [www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/what-we-do/hta-programs/community-based-tourism/](http://www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/what-we-do/hta-programs/community-based-tourism/) Members of neighborhood boards are on our HTA email distribution list and they were invited to participate in the community presentations. If you know of anyone who would like to help give input, please have them submit feedback by May 21: <https://bit.ly/3aX8fIA>. HTA has some money set aside to address actions in the DMAP. However, the counties, DLNR, and others will also bear the costs depending on jurisdiction and responsibility. The DMAP is a road map to follow.

## WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT

1. **Q: How can a small business get help to start a tour business ? Do need a license ? Permits? Would the tour industry do something like Uber or Lyft? Where a background check can be done and locals can start their own tours. Do we have a 24 cafe where locals can start their business and get licenses or permit as well..... (Eustace Hawker)**
2. **Q: Does the community plan include curriculum plans or programs for local schools? Seems like a way to help through a holistic narrative, reframe the us/them cycle. (Leanna Mix)**
3. **Q: I recently learned there is an organization PUEO (for educational Opportunities). Why not add this to expand choices to the tourist community and perpetuate Hawaiian culture as well This, along with other didfferent choices makes for a more varied tourist opportunity and increase interests besides beahces and sightseeing. (Deanna Aspengren)**
4. **Q: what about all the employees with no work? Green job training? (Damian Mcpherson)**
5. **Q: Has HTA linked ideas of public funding of education to tourism? There is a direct generational link. If you want HI to move to a knowledge economy, an economy that offers higher wages (tourism economies are always low wage economies on a global scale) it needs an educated public. This is KEY to a longterm analysis and look at the tourism issue. (Stephanie Han)**
6. **Q: Is there HTA representation from the UH School of Travel Industry Management? Both organizations can assist each other in their objectives. (Teo Fleming)**

A: HTA supports workforce development programs. HTA has partnered with the University of Hawai'i's Kapi'olani Community College, Maui College, Kaua'i Community College, and Hawai'i Community College to reinforce customer service industry standards and expectations. The community colleges offer trainings to obtain a certificate of professional development in customer service in Hawai'i in addition to a certification for Hawai'i's professional tour guides. Please check with the community colleges directly for the schedule for such classes. HTA also sponsors the Sustainable Tourism Association of Hawai'i, which has a third-party ecotourism certification program: [www.sustainabletourismhawaii.org/certification/](http://www.sustainabletourismhawaii.org/certification/). You should also register your business with the Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs. HTA also supports workforce development programs such as the L.E.I. (Leadership, Exploration, Inspiration) program. To learn more: [www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/what-we-do/hta-programs/workforce-development/](http://www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/what-we-do/hta-programs/workforce-development/).

John De Fries is also a member of the University of Hawai'i's School of Travel Industry Management at the Shidler College of Business Advisory Board. HTA staff also works closely with the UH TIM School through its Ho'oilina Scholarship Program and guest speaking at various course levels.

## HAWAI'I CONVENTION CENTER

1. **Q: Also what action will Convention Center take that is new and different from before in order to achieve higher operating success, before even the other pillars can be funded? (Rex Tai)**

2. **Q: Hawaii Convention Center should be a place where the island community can interact with tourists. However, its usage is geared to revenue generation like the Polynesian Cultural Center and not toward perpetuating our active Hawaiian culture and community. What actions are envisioned for taking these concerns into consideration in the present and future? (Don Aweau)**
3. **Q: As a follow-up to my question about attracting more conventions. Could a solution be to develop hotels contiguous to the convention center? (Sheldon Glassco)**
4. **Q: Mr. Egged, how will you replace the lost supply of short term rentals with legal supply of hotels that generate the most taxes? No new adjacent hotels to convention center for 50 years means you are only using legislative controls not market-based solutions to provide supply shortfall? HTA stats and Joe just said convention attendees and hotel guests are top spenders... (Rex Tai)**
5. **Q: One way to better manage the number of visitors is to attract business travelers, such as convention-goers. So what is being done to attract more conventions? (Sheldon Glassco)**

A: We are looking at messaging to our potential meetings, conventions and incentive (MCI) clients that the Hawai'i Convention Center (HCC) is a safe place to hold events, including ensuring public health standards are applied to all events (i.e., mask wearing, social distancing and other safety precautionary measures). HCC will also provide for a strong virtual capability. Many events as we move into the future will be held virtually for a portion of the attendees, and of course, some in person. Readiness in high tech broadband wireless meetings will gain more event bookings.

There is definitely a need for more hotel inventory in HCC's surrounding area and Waikiki in general, as the demand is higher than our pre-pandemic inventory. The HCC is reliant on the hotel inventory in Waikiki to host small, medium, and large citywide events. The growing increase in leisure travelers reduces the amount of rooms that our hotel partners are willing to allocate to HCC for room blocks at much lower rates. If HCC had a medium-sized hotel attached to it, we would then be able to take groups and not be solely reliant on our hotel partners for inventory. Although the Mandarin Hotel, which is a condotel, is planned to be constructed across the street, only 100 rooms of this property will be designated as "hotel rooms" and the average daily rate (ADR) is much higher than most citywide groups will pay. HTA was also looking at adding a limited-service hotel to the existing HCC property. We were exploring this as an option for HCC but the pandemic put all of that on the backburner.

The proposed draft actions developed by the Steering Committee did look at targeting the MCI visitor, and HTA will continue to work with its Global Marketing Team on tapping into this important market.

## **HOTSPOTS**

1. **Q: Who identifies the "hotspots"? And how? (Shari Larsen)**
2. **Q: The North Shore can tell you where our hot spots are - just ask us. We are here to help. (Kathleen Pahinui)**

3. **Q: A big travel trend, unfortunately fueled by social media, is having "off the beaten path" experiences. How can we regulate hot spots (or even "secret spots") when books/blogs/social media posts will always be out there enticing people? (Patti Jette)**
4. **Q: Again, referring to Laniakea "Turtle Beach" - if fees are charged for managed sites, this will cause places like Laniakea to explode with visitors. Has this been given thought? (Bonnie)**
5. **Q: Who will determine the hot spot carrying capacity? (Bob Leinau)**

A: The O‘ahu Steering Committee, which is made of up of members from various communities all around the island, is helping to identify the hotspots. Also, through the community input form, you are able to identify areas/places of concern. HTA and HVCB do not actively promote areas known as hotspots, however, with the rise of social media, visitors and residents find areas to explore that are off the beaten path. Part of the DMAP process involves coming up with actions to take regarding hotspots. Regarding Laniākea Beach on O‘ahu’s North Shore, the main problem does not have to do with too many beach-goers, but rather the traffic they cause when they walk or run across Kamehameha Highway or back their vehicle up into the highway. In Hawai‘i, shoreline public access is a common law right that is shared by residents and visitors. The various departments determine the appropriate capacity – such as DLNR determines capacity in state parks such as Diamond Head, and the City’s Parks department determines the appropriate capacity in city parks, etc.

#### **BRAND MARKETING**

1. **Q: How do you reconcile your branding for tourists to “live like locals” with burgeoning numbers of tourists staying in residential areas rather than in Waikiki? (Meril Fujiki)**
2. **Q: How to walk the line between what we expect of visitors to Hawai‘I and what we do when we visit other places? The need to model what we expect and to live that regardless of where we are. (Estelle Kelley)**
3. **Q: EUROPEAN VISITORS FIT PERFECTLY INTO YOUR NICHE MARKET THAT YOU WANT TO VISIT OAHU. WILL HTA BE FUNDED TO MARKET TO THIS AREA OF THE WORLD? (Greg Brossier)**

A: Neither HTA nor its Global Marketing Team (which includes the Hawai‘i Visitors & Convention Bureau and Hawai‘i Tourism Japan) promotes the theme of “live like a local.” Our latest campaign is “Mālama Hawai‘i” and responsible travel. We hope that we can influence people’s behaviors through education while they travel throughout the Hawaiian Islands. Currently our calendar year 2021 brand marketing budget is targeted to the U.S., Japan, Canada, Oceania (Australia and New Zealand) and South Korea markets. As we progress and see how the other countries are opening up amidst the pandemic, we will be investing our brand marketing budget in additional countries.

#### **RESIDENT SENTIMENT SURVEY**

1. **Q: Based on the survey data that HTA collects, what concrete actions will take to improve operations as a business yourself? (Red Tai)**

2. **Q: 1. Based on the survey data that HTA collected and published each year, what concrete actions will you take to improve operations? As a business yourself, how do you apply the data on your business? (Rex Tai)**
3. **Q: are the 2020 survey results prior to June 2020? i think the answers will be different afterward. (John Miller)**
4. **Q: How many residents are responding to these polls? Where are the majority of these statistics coming from? (Oriana McCallum)**

A: HTA contracts Omnitrak, which conducts the Resident Sentiment Surveys typically once a year. The purpose of the survey is to track resident attitudes towards tourism and identify positive and negative impacts of tourism on Hawai'i's residents – information that's then used to guide decision making. Omnitrak uses a region-based stratified sampling for the study, reaching out to residents via cell phone, landline, and online methods. The sample of residents was weighted proportionate to the population distribution based on Census data.

## **COMMUNITY**

1. **Q: How will HTA provide community benefits? It needs to be better defined, in the advantages and disadvantages as community stewardship will be an important concept of where and how resources will be used. (Don Aweau)**
2. **Q: This might be a premature question, but curious to know what communities are being targeted by this plan? On the west side of O'ahu, there is a small Waikiki that is growing with more hotels planned to be built and more development being geared towards supporting tourism being set up, which in turn blocks beaches, ocean, and land access to residents. In addition, does this plan look at limiting current tourist spaces like hotels, and transform them back to land and space beneficial to residents, so we can see a decrease in houseless, and again partake of natural resources? (Shari Larsen)**
3. **Q: Considering HTA's emphasis on community, will community boards and associations be contacted for transparency and opportunities to work together to accomplish these goals of managing tourism? (Oriana McCallum)**
4. **Q: Many of the issues have been known for a long time not sure why we need to study more - come to any neighborhood board and you will get a lot of good information especially those that are directly impacted by tourism. So why more study? How will you involve more of the community? (Kathleen Pahinui)**

A: HTA's staff and those volunteering on the O'ahu Steering Committee live in communities all around the island and provide information and experiences regarding the communities they live in. One of HTA's staff serves on the North Shore Neighborhood Board, and he provides invaluable insight to the team. The DMAP process is one of the ways we are trying to get the community's input in helping to rebuild, redefine, and reset tourism's direction. If you know of anyone who would like to help give input, please have them submit feedback by May 21: <https://bit.ly/3aX8f1A>. Creating the DMAP is the first step, and implementing the actions will be the next step, and that will require help from the appropriate agencies, departments, and the community.

## **FLIGHT PATTERNS**

- 1. Q: Along with HTA's commendable new consciousness toward protecting O'ahu's Natural Resources, Fragile Ecosystems, and State and City Parks and Beaches from the Land perspective, there also equally needs to be the consciousness of protecting these valued assets - as well as our communities - from the Air. How does HTA envision encouraging visitors to become aware of the significant adverse impacts of low- and close-flying helicopter tours, as well as encouraging all tour helicopter operators to responsibly fly well offshore? (Michelle Matson)**
- 2. Q: Prior to the 2008 recession the planes flew over the water. Then the flight patterns changed. (Oren Schlieman)**
- 3. Q: 6 million people a year fly over Palolo Valey to land on our island. Why Palolo? (Oren Schleiman)**
- 4. Q: I live in Palolo. Why must we bear the burden or air traffic waking us at 4 in the morning and keeping us from sleep at midnight? The concepts of social and economic justice might be part of the conversation. (Oren Schlieman)**

A: We encourage you to reach out to the U.S. Federal Aviation Administration (FAA), which is in charge of airport traffic patterns, with any concerns you have. Keep in mind that on those planes are both visitors and returning residents. The FAA also has the exclusive right to regulate aviation in the U.S., which includes helicopter aviation. As part of the DMAP process, we will share these concerns with the FAA.

## **RESERVATIONS SYSTEM**

- 1. Q: I like Rick Eggeds comments about needing online reservation tools to balance carrying capacity with visitors when they venture out of Waikiki to visit our natural resources. DLNR is moving in this direction. What ideas do you have for the role HTA can play? (Lisa Marten)**
- 2. Q: Sharing another random idea re: the proposed reservation system - Does this serve the needs of stakeholders involved thinking about the cost and time of developing the system, also the invonvenience to visitors (who are on a limited time crunch) and residents who crave those experiences? What if we implement a giveback x volunteer system (regenerative sustainability programs) to help educate and move towards an all hands onboard program increasing sustainability / volunteer initatives. This may also bring the local community and visitors together in working towards a common goal in giving back. Once the volunteer initiative is completed (i.e. filling one bag of trash) - they would be welcome to visit those cultural and environmental sites. (Francine Beppu)**
- 3. Q: Will a reservation system affect residents at natural and cultural sites? Why should residents be affected and potentially "bumped" from using our own resources? (Mike Leanio)**

A: HTA is actively working with the DLNR to explore ways we can assist with a statewide reservations system for parks. We feel that a reservations system will not be an inconvenience, but rather it will

be positive in helping visitors and residents plan ahead. Please review the efforts that were done at Hā'ena State Park as a model – it's a project that HTA helped with to assist with better management of park visitors and increase accessibility to residents:

<https://dlnr.hawaii.gov/dsp/parks/kauai/haena-state-park/>. A reservations system could possibly have a donation button built into it in case anyone wants to donate additional money to help our parks. We currently have a volunteer initiative called the Mālama Hawai'i program, which you can read about here: [www.gohawaii.com/malama](http://www.gohawaii.com/malama).

### **TRANSIENT ACCOMMODATIONS TAX**

- 1. Q: Is the current formula calculation for TAT funding the best formula to advance HTA's strategic pillars? What changes to the TAT formula would you make? (Mahina Paishon-Duarte)**
- 2. Q: How is TAT revenue used? (Wesley Stockstill)**
- 3. Q: There are many remote workers (thousands) in tech/finance/professional services who have moved here who are continuing to work remotely during COVID. The majority of these remote workers have rented housing (vs. hotel/short term rentals) so they are not paying any transient tax. How about charging the transient tax to ppl who are not residents to the state (i.e. if they do not have a Hawaii Drivers License) as a possible short term solution? These remote workers are highly paid and not paying any income tax here as they're from major metropolitan US cities and currently staying at rental housing - which in turn also impacts housing for locals. (Francine Beppu)**

A: The Legislature has proposed changes to the TAT distribution, which would eliminate the TAT funding for HTA. HTA would prefer to keep its dedicated funding of \$79 million in TAT allocation. Prior to the governor stopping the TAT distribution in May 2020 due to the COVID-19 pandemic emergency, this was the breakdown in Fiscal Year 2019: a total of \$600.3 million collected – of which \$340 million (56.6%) went to the state's general fund, \$79 million (13.2%) to HTA's Tourism Special Fund, \$16.5 million (2.7%) to the Hawai'i Convention Center, \$103 million (17.2%) to the counties, \$1.5 million (0.2%) to the Turtle Bay Special Fund, \$57.5 million (9.6%) to the Honolulu rail project, and \$3 million (0.5%) to the Department of Land and Natural Resources. The TAT is charged to those who are staying in legal accommodations across the state. If you know of anyone staying in an illegal vacation rental, please contact the City's Department of Planning and Permitting. If they are staying long-term, they would not need to pay a TAT if they are renting long-term housing. Temporary workers do contribute in other ways by spending money at places like restaurants and at retail stores.

### **TRAFFIC**

- 1. Q: Will the problems regarding Laniakea aka "Turtle Beach" EVER be resolved??? (Bonnie)**
- 2. Q: Often, regulations controlling tourist access to public sites such as beaches, trails, etc. target tour companies and their commercial vehicles by restricting their access. However, much of the overcrowding involves individuals in rental cars. How do we regulate these numbers, and how do we reach those tourists who aren't hiring guides to educate them about our culture and community? (Patti Jette)**

A: The Department of Transportation is actively working on solutions, specifically through its Kamehameha Highway Pedestrian Safety Project, in the vicinity of Laniākea Beach. HTA is also exploring ways to help as a short-term solution. The state cannot put a cap on the number of rental cars; however, the rental car companies will adjust their supply based on demand. Part of the issue has to do with the rise in illegal vacation rentals. Many of them are in our neighborhoods and require those guests to rent a vehicle to get around, and they often do not charge a parking fee as many hotels do, so there's no disincentive to rent a car. Please help us encourage the City to crack down on illegal vacation rentals. Regarding tourists who aren't hiring guides, it's not illegal to explore the island on your own without a guide, so there's no legal action that can be taken by the police regarding that.

### **HTA'S STRATEGIC PILLARS**

- 1. Q: How are the pillars balanced in the HTA strategic plan? Does one hold more priority because of its economic value as HTA has marketed in the past? (Don Awaeu)**
- 2. Q: Have you created a 'scorecard' to measure the success of these pillars? (Kimo Kippen)**

A: The pillars are equally weighted and intertwined. For more information, please refer to HTA's Strategic Plan: [www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/media/4286/hta-strategic-plan-2020-2025.pdf](http://www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/media/4286/hta-strategic-plan-2020-2025.pdf). HTA's measures of success are resident satisfaction, average daily visitor spending, visitor satisfaction, and total visitor spending.

### **'ĀINA ALOHA ECONOMIC FUTURES**

- 1. Q: Aloha esteemed panelists, mahalo for hosting today's conversation. The 'Aina Aloha Economic Futures has already developed a community-based regenerative tourism concept developed last year in 2020. I was curious if this effort has been referenced prior to today's conversation? (Mondenna Jamshidi Kent)**
- 2. Q: Have you considered collaborating with Aloha 'Aina organizations with helping to educate tourists on "how to act/respect" while visiting? (Keoni Willing)**

A: HTA's Board of Directors adopted the 'Āina Aloha Economic Futures declaration: [www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/media/4775/20-104-hta-aina-aloha-press-release.pdf](http://www.hawaiitourismauthority.org/media/4775/20-104-hta-aina-aloha-press-release.pdf). Also, HTA's Director of Hawaiian Cultural Affairs and Natural Resources is one of its co-authors. Hawaiian culture is one of HTA's strategic pillars, and HTA allocates millions of dollars annually to support programs that help to perpetuate the Hawaiian culture. Collaboration with Aloha 'Āina organizations has been identified as a possibility by the Steering Committee.

### **LOCAL BUSINESSES**

- 1. Q: Aloha, What steps are we taking to better integrate local businesses with tourism to attract or target visitors/customers that match our sustainable goals and pillars? (Laurie Ihara)**
- 2. Q: Is there any consideration to provide incentives for businesses who take part in sustainable and regenerative tourism business practices? Or disincentives for businesses that do not? (Adam Kurtz)**



A: HTA and its Global Marketing Team promote local businesses and experiences through GoHawaii: [www.gohawaii.com/experiences](http://www.gohawaii.com/experiences) and its marketing, public relations, and travel trade efforts. HTA also works in partnership with the Chamber of Commerce of Hawai'i and the Hawai'i Lodging and Tourism Association, which represent many local businesses. In addition, the counties have their own initiatives to encourage people to buy local.

## **SAFETY AND SECURITY**

- 1. Q: There are residents in communities stepping up to police and steward their places and resources from bad actors (tourists AND locals). They are doing great work, doing it respectfully, so how might tourism provide funds and other resources to support these efforts? (Keoni Lee)**
- 2. Q: Aloha, I am representing the community-based non-profit Ocean Safety 'Ohana: When looking at our community safety and wellbeing, are our county and state safety agencies being invited to the table? EMS, fire, ocean safety, DLNR? Are cultural stewards being invited to the table? We need those who have an intimate connection to place, mauka and makai, to share expertise and 'ike to keep both locals and visitors safe. We currently have a major safety issue with lack of signage and digital education on how to safely access our aina and kai. Many first responders in these arenas feel that they are not being heard, as well as locals and visitors who have lost loved ones due to not understanding how to safely access our aina and kai. Mass tourism is unsafe, we simply do not have the funding or infrastructure to host pre-pandemic numbers. Let's prioritize keeping everyone safe from both Covid and preventable recreational accidents, that is genuine aloha. Mahalo. (Jessamy Hornor)**

A: Citizen volunteers have helped law enforcement by alerting them of those breaking the law, and you're right that it includes both residents and visitors. The actual policing work, however, should be left up to those trained to handle those situations, especially ones that could pose a danger. HTA has allocated money – upwards of \$1.5 million annually to help support safety and security initiatives, including but not limited to assistance for lifeguards, security cameras in parks, and the visitor assistance programs.

## **INFRASTRUCTURE**

- 1. Q: Infrastructure is a huge issue inherent in this discussion. How can this be addressed in the context of the State and C&C disconnects? (Bonnie)**
- 2. Q: Is there time to implement placemaking similar to the Complete Streets program started by the City and County of Honolulu and counties to benefit the island community and visitors? (Don Aweau)**

A: HTA actively works to connect with the City, as evident by the DMAP Steering Committee, which has representation from the City and County of Honolulu. We must all work together to solve the current problems and plan for the future.

## **VISITOR SPENDING**

- 1. Q: How will HTA target new visitor groups that will spend more money per person? US mainland visitors are not premium spenders. (John Miller)**
- 2. Q: what are the national numbers showing for dollars spent by eco-tourism participants? (John Miller)**

A: Our target audience/visitor is the avid explorer – the mindful, responsible, and respectful traveler. The Hawai'i Visitors and Convention Bureau (HVCB), HTA's marketing contractor for the U.S., has launched the Mālama Hawai'i program. Marketing efforts were put on hold last year because of the COVID-19 pandemic. To read more about the Mālama Hawai'i program, please visit: [www.gohawaii.com/malama](http://www.gohawaii.com/malama).

One of the reasons why per-person spending went down over the years is because of the increase in the number of direct flights from out-of-state to the neighbor islands. In the past, if visitors wanted to go to a neighbor island, they would have to enter Hawai'i through Honolulu, then pay an additional fee for interisland airfare. Also, statistics show that vacation rentals are often cheaper than hotel rooms, and that has driven the per-person spending down in recent years.

Regarding eco-tourism, we do not keep track of national numbers for dollars spent, however, you can learn more about eco-tourism opportunities here: [www.gohawaii.com/experiences/eco-tourism](http://www.gohawaii.com/experiences/eco-tourism). And you can read more about a non-profit that HTA has supported and why sustainable tourism is important: [www.sustainabletourismhawaii.org](http://www.sustainabletourismhawaii.org).

## **CLIMATE CHANGE**

- 1. Q: John's reference to mālama honua is spot on and his approach is greatly appreciated. How does the Destination Management Plan address the greatest threat to our planet -- climate change? (Daniel Dinell)**

A: HTA is working to promote visitor industry alignment with the Aloha+ Challenge, which is Hawai'i's locally-driven framework to implement the United Nations 2030 Sustainable Development Goals. To learn more, please visit: [www.hawaiigreengrowth.org](http://www.hawaiigreengrowth.org).

## **VISITOR SENTIMENT**

- 1. Q: who care what visitors think? this is paradise and if they don't like it, they can go to florida (please) (m burke)**

A: Visitor satisfaction is one of HTA's four key performance indicators, in addition to resident satisfaction, average daily visitor spending, and total visitor spending. HTA conducts regular visitor satisfaction surveys, and you can view the reports here: <https://www.hawaiiitourismauthority.org/research/visitor-satisfaction-and-activity/>.

## **RESIDENT EDUCATION**

- 1. Q: I would like to suggest that encouraging responsible RESIDENT behavior is also important. For example, residents who also ignore/deface trail signs, park illegally, litter our parks/sites and harrass our monk seals. (Pauline Worsham)**
- 2. Q: Many years ago there was a marketing campaign that promoted the concept that Tourism is good for Hawaii. How did that work? What impact did it have? (Kimo Kippen)**

A: Thank you for your suggestion of encouraging responsible resident behavior is also important. You are spot on.

If you are referring to the 2016 resident marketing campaign that the HTA produced, "Tourism is a Family Business," which showcased how tourism businesses impact all of Hawai'i's families whether directly or indirectly, some residents could relate to the messaging, while others were critical of it.